

**CLEMSON**  
UNIVERSITY  
College Bylaws Routing Sheet

**Requirements based on 2021-2022 *Faculty Manual***

In accordance with the 2021-2022 *Faculty Manual* Chapter XI, K1d and Chapter II, Article III-1, "The faculty members of each college within the university are organized as Collegiate Faculties according to individual college bylaws approved by the Executive Vice President for Academic Affairs and Provost."

This document is intended to support the documentation of the required approvals.

College: College of Science

The attached Bylaws were approved at the College Faculty Meeting on: December 10, 2021

**Faculty Manual Editorial Consultant**

I have reviewed this document for conformance to the Clemson University *Faculty Manual*.

The review is attached immediately following this page.

Approved

Provost *Robert J. Jones*

Revision Required (see comments)

Date 1/11/22

**Requirements for COLLEGE BYLAWS – 2021-2022 *Faculty Manual***

College of Science

Date

12/22/2021

*NOTE:* College bylaws require approval by the Provost (Ch II, Article III-1 and Ch IX, K1d). This list may be useful to ensure that college bylaws conform with the *Faculty Manual*.

Updated 8/12/2019. This list only differs from the 2017-2018 and 2018-2019 list in some section numbers; all requirements are the same.

Compliance

Requirement	Reference	Compliance		
		Yes	No	N/A
1 College Bylaws may not contradict the <i>Faculty Manual</i>	Ch III, A1c	X		
2 Statement that college bylaws may not contradict the <i>Faculty Manual</i>	Ch IX, K1e	X		
3 A statement that individuals with special faculty ranks have voting privileges; If this statement is not included then voting privileges ARE NOT granted to faculty with special ranks	Ch IV, B2g	X		
4 Consistent with the opportunity to establish other duties assigned to the dean	Ch VIII, G2r	X		
5 Consistent with the opportunity to establish other duties assigned to the department chair	Ch VIII, I2p	X		
6 Consistent with mechanisms to select or elect members to college and university committees in the <i>Faculty Manual</i>	Ch IX, D2a, i	X		
7 Consistent with mechanisms to select or elect members in the case of vacancies to college and university committees in the <i>Faculty Manual</i>	Ch IX, D2a, i	X		
8 Consistent with the requirement to have a process to elect college representatives to the Council on Graduate Studies and its sub-committees	Ch IX, F3b, i	X		
9 Consistent with the requirement that there are formal College meetings at least once during each long semester	Ch IX, K2a	X		
10 Consistent with the requirement that standing and other committees of the college report to the faculty at formal College meetings	Ch IX, K2b	X		
11 Consistent with the requirement that there is the opportunity for any member of the collegiate faculty to raise questions about academic affairs of the college	Ch IX, K2c	X		
12 Consistent with the requirement that recommendations from the college faculty are forwarded to appropriate University officials and groups	Ch IX, K2d	X		
13 Consistent with the requirement that minutes of collegiate faculty meetings are forwarded to the Provost and President for information	Ch IX, K2e	X		
14 A standing curriculum committee is required. There may be separate undergraduate and graduate committees	Ch IX, K3b	X		
15 Each curriculum committee elects own chair	Ch IX, K3c	X		
16 The College Curriculum Committee Chair (or College Undergraduate Curriculum Committee Chair if there is one) serves on the Undergraduate Curriculum Committee along with a second representative elected by the committee	Ch II, Art IV, 2; Ch IX, K3c & d	X		
17 If there is a graduate Committee, the chair serves on the University Graduate Curriculum Committee; If there is no Graduate Committee then the College Curriculum Committee names the College representative to the University Graduate Curriculum Committee	Ch II, Art IV, 2; Ch IX, K3d & e	X		
18 Only regular faculty may vote on the curriculum committees	Ch IX, K3f	X		
19 The process for electing representatives to the college curriculum committee must be stated in the college bylaws; If the number of departments in the college is small, the college bylaws may specify an alternate procedure for establishing committee membership	Ch IX, K3g & K3g, i	X		
20 Terms of service on the curriculum committee(s) are determined by Faculty in the college and must be specified in the bylaws	Ch IX, K3h	X		
21 Consistent with the requirement that curricular recommendations are acted upon by the collegiate faculty and/or appropriate college curriculum committee	Ch IX, K3i	X		
22 Collegiate faculty may establish other standing committees, whose composition and membership are determined by the collegiate faculty in accordance with the College bylaws	Ch IX, K4a	X		
23 Consistent with the requirement that ad hoc committees may be established at the discretion of the dean	Ch IX, K4b	X		
24 Consistent with the requirement that membership on collegiate committees, except as noted in Ch IX, D3 of the <i>Faculty Manual</i> , need not be confined to regular faculty; College bylaws shall provide for Faculty, special faculty, student, and staff representation whenever appropriate; Ch IX, D3 restricts college and university curriculum committees, college advisory committees, Faculty Senate and the Grievance Board to have voting members only being regular faculty)	Ch IX, K5	X		
25 Consistent with the requirement that collegiate peer review committees for TPR are only authorized if contained in College Bylaws	Ch II, Art III-2	X		

Note The College of Science has two TPR advisory committees in its bylaws.



## BYLAWS OF THE COLLEGE OF SCIENCE CLEMSON UNIVERSITY

Amended and Approved by College of Science Faculty – December 10, 2021

Amended and Approved by College of Science Faculty – December 4, 2020; April 2, 2021  
Approved by Provost Robert H. Jones – May 2, 2021

Amended and Approved by College of Science Faculty – December 5, 2019  
Approved by Provost Robert H. Jones – January 10, 2020

Amended and Approved by College of Science Faculty – December 7, 2018  
Approved by Provost Robert H. Jones – December 14, 2018

Adopted by College of Science Faculty – March 21, 2016

### ARTICLE I: Function and Terminology

**Section 1. Function.** The purpose of these bylaws is to describe the procedures for creating and revising policies and making decisions within the College of Science (hereafter, the College). The procedures include descriptions of the composition and duties of the College’s standing committees, as well as the mechanism for electing faculty to them. These bylaws apply to all faculty members who hold an appointment within the College. These bylaws may not contradict the *Faculty Manual*. In all cases, the policies and procedures given in the *Faculty Manual* take precedence over these College bylaws.

**Section 2. Terminology.** The following terms are as defined in the *Faculty Manual* when they appear in **Bold** in these Bylaws: **Faculty**, **Regular faculty**, **Special faculty**, **faculty**.

- a. The **faculty** of each academic department of the College is composed of those members of the College duly appointed to that department. The department **faculty** is responsible for matters pertaining to that department. Each department is responsible for developing an appropriate administrative structure for its operation. Each departmental **faculty** is to meet at least once a semester.
- b. **Department** refers to the following academic units: Department of Biological Sciences, Department of Chemistry, Department of Genetics and Biochemistry, Department of Physics and Astronomy, School of Mathematical and Statistical Sciences.

### ARTICLE II: Membership

**Section 1. Membership.** All **faculty** members who hold an appointment in the College are considered members of the College **faculty**. A complete list of all College **faculty** members with ranks shall be updated and made available to the Chair of the College Elections Committee by the Dean’s Office in September of each year.

**Section 2. Voting Membership.** Voting members of the College shall consist of all **faculty** who hold at least a 50% appointment within the College, including those on sabbatical leave or leave without pay, holding the following ranks: Assistant Professor, Associate Professor, Professor, Lecturer, Senior Lecturer, Principal Lecturer, Research Assistant Professor, Research Associate Professor, and Research Professor. Voting eligible **faculty** may vote in all College votes and all College elections except for those restricted to **Regular faculty** by the Faculty Manual and/or the Constitution of the Faculty of Clemson University.

### **ARTICLE III: Meetings**

**Section 1. Regular Meetings.** Regular meetings of College **faculty** (hereafter, College faculty meetings) shall be held at least once during each of the long semesters. All standing and other committees shall report to the faculty during these meetings. The Dean or the Dean's **Faculty** representative shall preside over all College faculty meetings and shall appoint a secretary. Minutes shall be written by the secretary and signed by the Dean. An electronic copy of the signed minutes shall be forwarded to the Provost, President, and to each Department Chair within the College. The Dean's office shall send notice of all meetings at least one week prior to the meeting and maintain an archive of the electronic copy of the minutes and make them readily available upon request to all College faculty.

**Section 2. Call for Special Meetings.** Any member of the **faculty** may call for a College faculty meeting by presenting the Dean with a written request for such a meeting signed by at least 10% of the College **faculty**. The request shall include the reason for the meeting. Upon receipt of the request, the Dean shall schedule the meeting within two weeks; however, if such request is made between May 1 and August 15, or between December 1 and the beginning of classes in January, the Dean shall schedule the meeting as soon as practical but not later than two weeks after the beginning of the Fall or Spring semester immediately following the semester in which the request is made.

**Section 3. Agenda Items.** The Dean shall receive items for the agenda from the College committees (Article V) and members of the **faculty**. The agenda shall be finalized and distributed by the Dean at least one week prior to the meeting.

The Standing Agenda will be as follows:

1. Special Orders
2. Approval of Minutes
3. Reports
  - a. Standing Committees
  - b. *Ad hoc* Committees
  - c. Faculty Senate
4. Unfinished Business
5. New Business

**Section 4. Quorum.** A quorum for College faculty meeting shall consist of at least 25% of all voting members. Quorums for College committee meetings shall consist of a simple majority of each committee's voting membership. All College meetings require a quorum if any business

necessitating a vote is conducted, with one exception: for the purpose of voting on degree candidates, the quorum shall be the percentage deemed necessary by the presiding officer to conduct business.

#### **ARTICLE IV: Procedures by Which the Faculty Shall Operate**

**Section 1. Distribution of Bylaws.** A copy of these bylaws shall be distributed to all **faculty** members upon ratification by the **Faculty**, and whenever amendments to these bylaws are made.

**Section 2. Ratification.** These bylaws shall become effective upon ratification by at least 50% of the voting members of the College and approval by the Provost.

**Section 3. Amendments to Bylaws.** Amendments to the bylaws require a two-thirds vote of eligible members present and voting at a meeting called according to the procedures listed in Article I of these bylaws. Notice of proposed amendments must be published and distributed at least two weeks prior to the meeting at which they are to be considered.

**Section 4. Voting and Rules of Order.** In all College faculty meetings where a quorum is present, all matters shall be resolved by a simple majority vote of those eligible members present and voting, unless indicated otherwise elsewhere in this document. All College faculty meetings shall be conducted according to the most recent edition of *Robert's Rules of Order*, unless the Rules of Order are inconsistent with either the *Clemson University Faculty Manual*, these bylaws, or any special rules of order adopted by this faculty. Electronic means of vote tallying shall be allowed.

**Section 5. Procedure Regarding Resolutions.** Any resolution submitted for a vote at a College faculty meeting must be distributed to the **faculty** in written form at least two weeks prior to the meeting. Only voting members present at the meeting shall be permitted to vote on the resolution.

**Section 6. Approval of Candidates for Graduation.** Each degree-granting department shall review and approve its own candidates for graduation following procedures established by each department. The appropriate Associate Dean shall call a meeting of the Department Chairs and School Directors (or their designee) to effect final approval of the candidates for graduation on behalf of the **faculty** of the college.

**Section 7. Recommendations from the College Faculty.** All recommendations from the **faculty** are to be forwarded to the appropriate University council, committee, or administrative officer.

#### **ARTICLE V: Standing Committees**

**Section 1. Terms of Service and Procedures.** Individual terms of service on standing committees shall be for two years and renewable for up to two additional terms (six years total). Each department shall simultaneously elect their representatives to the standing committees using inclusive practices for service terms that begin on April 1, except for the Scholarship and Awards Committee for which the service term begins August 15. Each committee shall meet as often as necessary to fulfill its charge. Each committee shall develop its specific operating procedures, including selection of a committee chair, unless noted otherwise. Minutes shall be recorded for

each meeting of a standing committee and forwarded to the office of the Dean for archival purposes. Collegiate **faculty** may establish other standing committees as an amendment to the bylaws.

**Section 2. Limitation on Faculty Service.** All **faculty** shall be limited to service on no more than two Standing Committees at the same time.

**Section 3. Ad Hoc Committees.** The Dean, or majority of the Faculty Advisory Committee membership shall have the authority to charge *ad hoc* committees. Any **faculty** member can petition the Faculty Advisory Committee to charge an *ad hoc* committee. The Faculty Advisory Committee shall appoint members of *ad hoc* committees or determine how such members shall be appointed. An *ad hoc* committee must be established for a specific, single purpose and can serve no longer than twelve (12) months. An *ad hoc* committee cannot become a standing committee without a change in bylaws being approved by the College **Faculty**. The Dean of the College shall notify the **faculty** on any new *ad hoc* committee and its purpose within two weeks of its establishment. *Ad hoc* committees shall report during College faculty meetings.

**Section 4. College Faculty Advisory Committee.**

- a. *Composition:* The College Faculty Advisory Committee shall be comprised of the Faculty Senators, Delegates and Alternates of the College. In addition, any department without **Regular** faculty representation on the committee shall elect one **Regular faculty** representative to serve on the College Faculty Advisory Committee. The Dean of the College shall chair the College Faculty Advisory Committee.
- b. *Duties:* The College Faculty Advisory Committee shall advise the Dean on any matter which is of concern to the discovery, learning, and engagement missions, and funding priorities of the College. The committee shall provide guidance for the development of plans of the College, which are not the purview of any other part of the faculty organization of the College.

**Section 5. College Curriculum Committee.**

- a. *Composition:* This committee shall be comprised of two elected **faculty** members from each department of the college. At least one of the elected faculty representatives from each department must be a **Regular faculty** member. Only **Regular faculty** may vote. The College representative to the Honors College Committee will serve in an advisory capacity. The committee shall elect from its membership a chairperson, who shall call and conduct all meetings of the committee, and who shall serve as the College's representative to the University Undergraduate Curriculum Committee. The committee shall elect from its membership a second person to serve on the University Undergraduate Curriculum Committee. The committee shall also elect two of its members to serve as the College's representatives to the University Graduate Curriculum Committee. Membership on this committee is not restricted by the term limit for standing committee membership outlined in Article V, Section 1.
- b. *Duties:* This committee shall have responsibility for evaluating and making recommendations on behalf of the faculty on all proposals for new or revised academic requirements, courses, and curricula within the College. It shall also review all curriculum proposals that emanate from the University Curriculum Committees or the other collegiate faculties, whose effect would be university-wide, and shall ensure the adherence of such

proposals to all applicable college policies and curricular requirements. Notice of, and an agenda for, all committee meetings shall be provided to all committee members one week prior to the meeting. The committee shall distribute its recommendations to the **faculty** within two working days of meetings through Curriculog, or any system replacing Curriculog and accessible to the **faculty**.

- c. *Faculty Review of Curriculum Recommendations:* The **faculty** may petition to review any recommendation of the Curriculum Committee. Such petition requires the presentation to the College Faculty Advisory Committee of a written request, signed by at least 10% of the College **faculty**, stating specifically the recommendation or recommendations to be reviewed. Such a petition must be submitted within two weeks following the date on which the Curriculum Committee has distributed its recommendation to the **faculty**. The Dean shall then call a special College faculty meeting to review the recommendation unless the next regularly scheduled College faculty meeting is within four weeks of the presentation to the College Faculty Advisory Committee. A two-thirds majority of those present and voting is necessary to overrule the recommendation of the Curriculum Committee. Unless the faculty elects to review and reject a recommendation of the Curriculum Committee, the committee's recommendation shall be considered as the decision of the faculty and are to be acted upon by collegiate faculty and/or appropriate college committees. However, once a petition to review one or more recommendations of the Curriculum Committee has been filed as per this section, such recommendation or recommendations shall not be considered final until voted upon.

#### **Section 6. Student Scholarship and Awards Committee.**

- a. *Composition:* This committee shall be comprised of one **faculty** elected by each department. The committee shall elect from its membership a chairperson, who shall call and conduct all meetings of the committee, and who shall serve as the College's representative to the University Scholarship and Awards Committee. The committee shall also elect one of its members to serve as the College's representatives to the University Graduate Fellowship and Awards Committee.
- b. *Duties:* This committee shall meet to address and act on undergraduate and graduate student scholarship and award issues that are broad in scope and impact more than one department. This committee shall also identify candidates for any college-wide student awards and scholarships, select the recipients, and encourage faculty participation in the nomination process and in Honors and Awards Day. The chairperson of the committee shall be responsible for coordinating the College's Honors and Awards Day ceremonies.

#### **Section 7. Discovery Committee.**

- a. *Composition:* This committee shall be comprised of one **Regular faculty** elected by each department. The Associate Dean who oversees the discovery mission of the College shall chair the committee and serve as a non-voting member. This committee shall elect from its membership representatives to serve on any research-related University committees.
- b. *Duties:* The Discovery Committee shall advise the Dean on research resource needs of the college; identify opportunities for participation of students, faculty, and staff in research projects, and disseminate information about these opportunities; promote the college's research agenda; and facilitate the recognition and dissemination of the research successes in the college.

## Section 8. Elections Committee.

- a. *Composition:* This committee shall be comprised of one **faculty** from each department. The committee shall elect from its membership a chairperson, who shall call and conduct all meetings of the committee and coordinate the activities of the committee as described herein.
- b. *Duties:* The purpose of this committee is to conduct and ensure the election of College representation to College and University councils, commissions, and committees, and the Faculty Senate. The committee should seek equitable representation on college and university committees across all of the departments in the College.
- c. *Vacancies:* Vacancies on university committees and the Faculty Senate shall be filled through a college-wide election held each March. In the event that a vacancy to a university committee occurs mid-year, the Dean shall appoint a temporary replacement to fill the vacancy until the next March election. When a vacancy on a College Committee results from the departure (or official leave) of a faculty member, the Chair/Director of that member's department shall appoint a **Regular faculty** member to fill the vacancy for the remainder of that academic year. If a vacancy on a College Committee occurs for any other reason, the College Elections Committee shall charge the departmental representative on the committee to hold supplementary elections in the department to fill the vacancy. Vacancies created on the Faculty Senate for any cause shall be filled for the unexpired terms by supplementary elections within the College as soon as such vacancies occur.
- d. *College-level Committees:*
  1. By March 1, the College Elections Chair shall send each member of the College Election Committee a list of those College committee members who are at the end of their terms and are to be replaced.
  2. Each department shall select its representative(s) to College committees according to its bylaws, and its College Elections Committee representative shall notify the College Elections Chair by March 31.
  3. The election committee shall ensure that the provision in Article V, section 2, regarding limits on faculty service, is observed.
- e. *University-level Committees and Faculty Senate:*
  1. The Dean's office shall notify the College Elections Chair of positions that need to be filled by February 20. By March 1, the Elections Chair shall send the list to each member of the College Election Committee, allowing at least two weeks for nomination collection within units. The Committee shall then notify the **faculty** about the College election dates and procedures.
  2. The College Elections Committee shall collate all nominations into a slate; and create and distribute the ballot at least one week prior to the first day of the election. During this time candidates may campaign. No write-in ballots are allowed.
  3. The College Elections Committee conducts the balloting. The voting runs for at least three business days and shall be finished by March 31. An electronic voting format shall be used unless unfeasible. The Elections Committee counts and verifies the votes. For committees with more than one vacancy (including alternates, when required), the candidate receiving the most votes shall fill the position with the



longest term. Where there is an alternate seat to fill, after all regular seats are filled, the candidate with the next largest number of votes shall fill the alternate seat. In the case of a tie, the College Elections Committee shall flip a coin to determine the representative. Members of the College Elections Committee distribute the results of the elections to their departments.

4. Each College Committee elects its chair and other representatives to university committees, as specified in these bylaws, at its first meeting after the elections. This meeting should be held before the end of the Spring semester. The terms of office for new Faculty Senate members begin with the April meeting of the Senate. The committees notify the Dean and Election Committee Chair of the results. A list of all College committee members, chairs, and University committee representatives from the College shall be kept by the Dean's office and by the College Elections Committee Chair.

### **Section 9. College Bylaws Committee.**

- a. *Composition:* One Faculty Senator or Faculty Senate Delegate from each department selected by the College Faculty Advisory Committee, and a non-voting staff member from the Dean's office, shall comprise the College Bylaws Committee. If there is no Faculty Senator or Delegate for a department during the term, the faculty of such department selects their **faculty** representative by April 15<sup>th</sup> each year. Other non-voting topic area experts may serve as needed. The Lead Faculty Senator or their designee shall serve as chair of the College Bylaws Committee. Membership on this committee is not subject to the restriction outlined in the provision in Article V, section 2, regarding limits on faculty service.
- b. *Duties:* The College Bylaws Committee shall review requests for revisions to the College Bylaws annually. Proposed amendments to the College Bylaws may be submitted by any College of Science faculty member directly to the College Bylaws Committee chair and must be received in writing by no later than September 15<sup>th</sup> each year. Amendments proposed by September 15<sup>th</sup> each year shall be reviewed for deliberation and consideration in time for voting by the December College of Science faculty meeting. Any such changes go into effect January 1<sup>st</sup> of the same academic year to enable committee seats to be filled during the election period.

### **Section 10. College Global Engagement Advisory Committee.**

- a. *Composition:* This committee shall be comprised of one **faculty** elected by each department. The staff members of the College of Science Global Program shall serve as *ex officio* members of the committee. Other non-voting topic area experts may serve as needed at the discretion of the committee. The Associate Dean charged with the global engagement mission of the College shall serve as chair in a non-voting capacity.
- b. *Duties:* The College Global Engagement Advisory Committee shall advise the College leadership on strategic global priorities including discovery, learning, and engagement. This committee shall help the appropriate Associate Dean to facilitate global engagement opportunities for students, faculty and staff, help promote the global engagement agenda, and identify methods to highlight global engagement successes in the College. The committee shall provide guidance for the development of plans of the College that are related to global engagement.

## Section 11. Inclusive Excellence Committee.

- a. *Composition:* The committee shall be comprised of one **Regular faculty** elected by each Department, two elected lecturers (at any rank) from different departments, and two elected staff members from different units. Additionally, the Dean will appoint the following members of the committee: one **Regular faculty**, one administrative faculty, and two students from different departments (one undergraduate, one graduate). All committee members will have full voting rights for matters within the Committee. The chair will be the administrative faculty appointed to the committee. The chair will assume assessment responsibility for the College Diversity Plan. The chair shall call and conduct all meetings of the committee and they (or their designee) shall serve as the College's representative to the University Council on Inclusion and Equity.
- b. *Duties:* The committee shall advise the College leadership on defining, monitoring, and reviewing Inclusive Excellence strategies within the College, especially evaluating and making recommendations on behalf of the faculty, staff, and students on all proposals for new or revised initiatives incorporated into the College Diversity Plan. The committee shall also be responsible for assessing progress toward diversity and inclusion goals as outlined in the College Diversity Plan. The committee shall meet at minimum once per regular term, but may meet more often if necessary to perform its duties. Notice of, and an agenda for, all committee meetings shall be provided to all committee members one week prior to the meeting.
- c. *Proposal of Initiatives:* Any member of the College of Science may petition to propose or replace initiatives for consideration by the committee.

## Section 12. IT Advisory Committee

- a. *Composition:* This committee shall be comprised of one **faculty** member elected by each department, and two staff members (one administrative and one technical) elected by the staff of the College. The Dean may appoint a non-voting member to serve as a liaison to the Dean's office. The Science IT Services team lead shall serve as a non-voting *ex officio* member of the committee. Other non-voting topic area experts may serve as needed at the discretion of the committee. The committee shall elect from its membership a chairperson, who shall call and conduct all meetings.
- b. *Duties:* This committee shall develop and promote College-level IT policies and advise the Dean on IT policies and resource needs of the college, including classroom technology, teleconference and distance learning, computer lab and science lab IT technology, networking and telecom, College-wide IT resources (such as staffing levels, web services and file storage), software and services licensing, IT projects and initiatives, and research computing.
- c. *Proposal of Initiatives:* Any member of the College of Science may petition to propose or replace initiatives for consideration by the committee. Such petitions will be considered by the committee in a timely manner.

### **Section 13. College Tenure and Promotion Committees**

- a. *Composition:* The Dean shall convene two committees within the college to provide assistance and advice pertaining to Tenure and Promotion reviews following the TPR guidelines developed in the individual units of the college. Membership of the first will be comprised of the TPR committee chairs from each department or school within the College. Membership of the second committee will be comprised of the chair or director of each department or school within the College. The Dean will serve as the chair of these two committees. The membership on these committees is not restricted by the term limit for standing committee membership outlined in Article V, Section 1 of these By-laws. The committees shall not maintain minutes in order to discuss confidential matters pertaining to promotion and tenure.
  
- b. *Duties:* The Dean provides a recommendation on the merits of the candidate's tenure and promotion package based on the TPR guidelines established in the relevant unit of the College. Thus, these committees shall serve in a strictly advisory capacity to the Dean in order to provide additional context or clarification on the tenure and promotion recommendations that were made by the departmental/school TPR committee or the department or school chair/director, respectively. The committees shall not vote on the merits of tenure and promotion packages and shall not provide a formal recommendation on the merits of tenure and promotion packages to the Dean.